Marine Finfish Aquaculture Mass Mortality Events and Aquaculture Occupational Health and Safety: Assessing Hazards and Risk

Barbara Neis

Presentation to the Yale Occupational and Environmental Health Program May 28, 2024

*An earlier version of this presentation was delivered at ICOH in January, 2022 and to the meetings of the World Aquaculture Society, (North America), St. John's, NL. 2022.

I have no conflicts to declare





Other contributing authors:

- Lissandra Souto-Cavalli, Department of Agricultural Diagnosis and Research, Porto Alegre, Brazil
- Wenzhao Gao, Ocean Frontier Institute, Memorial University, St. John's, Canada
- **Mohamed F. Jeebhay**, Occupational Medicine Division and Centre for Environmental & Occupational Health Research, University of Cape Town, Cape Town, South Africa
- Trine Thorvaldsen, SINTEF Ocean, Department of Aquaculture, Trondheim, Norway
- Ingunn M. Holmen, SINTEF Ocean, Department of Fisheries and New Biomarine Industry, Trondheim, Norway
- Andrew Watterson, Public Health Research Group Faculty of Health, University of Stirling, Stirling, Scotland
- Matthias Beck, Department of Management and Marketing, Cork University, Cork, Ireland
- Cory Ochs, Community Health and Humanities and Ocean Frontier Institute, Memorial University, St. John's, Canada
- Maria Lopez-Gomez, Dept. of Sociology and Ocean Frontier Institute, Memorial University, St. John's, Canada
- Carlos Tapia Jopia, Centro de Estudios de Sistemas Sociales, Oficina Coquimbo, Coquimbo, Chile



Presentation Overview

- Global Expansion of Aquaculture and Complexity of the Sector
- Mass Mortality Events introduction
- Aquaculture OHS
- The research problem and methods for the MME hazards and risk assessment exercise more generally and methods for the OHS piece of that exercise
- Some key findings
- Conclusions and recommendations





<

Search

THE STATE OF WORLD FISHERIES AND AQUACULTURE 2022

PART 1 WORLD REVIEW



NOTES: Data exclude shells and pearls. Data expressed in live weight equivalent. SOURCE: FAO.

30-

CEAN FRONTIER INSTITUTE

Mass Mortality Events (MMEs)

MMEs = events where large numbers of organisms (thousands to millions) die in a short period of time (Fey et al., 2015; Munasinghe et al., 2008; Koopmans et al., 2004)

 E.g. outbreaks of avian influenza (also called "bird flu") = devastation in animal populations, including poultry, wild birds, and some mammals; harm farmers' livelihoods and the food trade. Although largely affecting animals, these outbreaks pose ongoing risks to humans. (WHO 2023)

Fish mortality always a concern in farmed salmon production, MMEs of particular concern (scale and rapidity of loss, and associated effects on communities dependent on aquaculture). (singh, G. G., Sajid, Z., & Mather, C., 2024)

MME risk and consequences are under-researched in aquaculture

Agents responsible for MMEs in salmon aquaculture are not infectious for humans but MMEs can entail risks to worker health (our focus here)



MMEs in finfish aquaculture: a widespread and growing concern

Salmon 'die-off' incident raises concerns about the state's future in large-scale aquaculture

May 28, 2019

Norway loses millions of farmed salmon to algae bloom



Photo credit: Ballangen Fish Farm



RADIO CANADA INTERNATIONAL

Fish farming controversy over massive salmon die-off MARC MONTGOMERY Deadly algae kill 4,200 tonnes of Chilean salmon

DEP finds no permit violations associated with recent 'die-off' incident at salmon farm off MDI

Mowi experiences more salmon die-offs in Canada, Ireland

Marine Harvest reports massive smolt dieoff in Norway

> Mass Die-Off of Farmed Salmon Linked to Climate Change

Chilean salmon farmer reports massive 1 million salmon die-off; cause unknown

Aquaculture is a hazardous sector

- Diverse and variable safety, physical, chemical, biological, ergonomic and psychosocial hazards (Ngajilo and Jeebhay 2019)
- Documented aquaculture injury rates exceed average national/state/provincial rates (Holmen and Thorvaldsen 2018; Mitchell and Lystad, 2019; Ochs et al. 2021; Fry et al. 2019).
- Limited knowledge of occupational exposures, risk factors and associated adverse health outcomes, especially in low and middle - income countries (Ngajilo and Jeebhay 2019)
- Major data gaps around the adoption and implementation of regulatory standards, industry practices, and their health and safety management systems (Watterson et al. 2019)





OHS risk in marine aquaculture

- Aquaculture accident causality is often complex and associated with a range of contributing factors (Thorvaldsen et al., 2015).
- Involves rearing live animals affecting the risk profile of the sector (Holen et al. 2019; Yang et al. 2019)
- Monitoring and penalties for certain kinds of events affecting fish health or the environment can lead workers to focus on these issues versus OHS (Storkerson 2012)
- MMEs can be thought of as a type of major accident but, unlike the oil and gas and chemical sectors, attempts to develop holistic risk management systems for aquaculture are in their infancy (Holen et al. 2019).



The Larger Project

Problem: MMEs seem to be increasing in salmon aquaculture and can have different causes. Design a risk assessment exercise to assess causes and consequences of MMEs

Methodology:

- a) Develop a database of salmon aquaculture MMEs and document trends (Singh et al. 2024)
- b) Assemble a large, multidisciplinary team of salmon aquaculture experts with expertise on diverse potential risk factors related to causes and consequences of MMEs.
- c) Ask teams to develop risk assessments based on their expertise (i.e. water temperature, fish nutrition, disease, harmful algae blooms, occupational health and safety, community impacts).
- d) Expert elicitation process involving leaders of all teams to discuss preliminary risk assessments and to build a pathway model based on each of the separate, potentially intersecting pieces (Sajid et al. 2024).



MME OHS Hazard and Risk Assessment

OHS Subproject Methods:

Multi-national desktop exercise by AOHS researchers from 5 countries using:

- $\checkmark\,$ information on definitions of MMEs
- ✓ incident reports
- ✓ legal and regulatory guidance and documentation
- ✓ media coverage
- Develop 5 country profiles
- Profile synthesis
- Participate in a multi-disciplinary, expert elicitation risk assessment process encompassing potential causes and consequences of MMEs
- Refine AOHS risk assessment including pathway analysis



Total number of fish mortalities reported by country*

* Not just MMEs



Source: G. Singh, Z. Sajid, Charles Mather, 2024.



Used with permission.

10

MMEs by country 2012-2022

Events include the top 10% of events as measured by the number of fish lost within each country. For the top three countries, the number of fish lost in the top 10% of MMEs is on the rise.

There are problems with the data from Chile, Australia and New Zealand that make it difficult to compare.

Source: Singh et al. 2024. Used with permission.





30-

MMEs in Aquaculture

The sudden death of thousands to millions of fish in finfish aquaculture.



Significant asset losses; compliance threats to environmental, animal health and occupational health and safety obligations; can undermine social license to operate.

Trigger rapid mobilization of workers, vessels and other supports to identify the extent and cause of the event, plan and undertake operations for removal, transport, and disposal of dead finfish and can lead to changes in fish production and location



Activities and Hazards Associated with MMEs

- Travel to and from cages (marine shipping and transport capacity)
- Work on and under cages (Mort removal; diving/pumping)
- Mort transport (fish/slurry)
- Mort rendering/processing
- Net removal & cleaning
- Post-event cage repositioning (diving, work on cages and vessels, cranes)

- Vessel and weather-related hazards
- Diving/chemical/biological hazards in the water and on vessels
- Confined space working
- Net lifting, anchoring, manual materials handling
- Fast-paced work/long hours/stress/fatigue



Diving and MME mort removal in Newfoundland (NL) 2019

Media coverage for the MME reported a diver had to be transported several hundred km from the site to St. John's for hyperbaric treatment due to decompression illness, other stories suggested chaotic approach to accessing divers...

Report on the MME:

"During the mort removal process diver safety was a major concern. Diving practices were inspected by outside agencies to ensure safety. Initially, Barry's was advised that the divers were not allowed to be in the netpen while they were pumping out the fish due to diver safety. However, there was no way to determine where the fish were in the netpen and pumping was going very slow (*sic*). Eventually a Diver Safety SOP was implemented" (Fisheries and Marine Institute 2020, p. 24)



Diving and MME mort removal NL

"[the company] did not have a contingency plan to have additional divers on call beyond their normal needs...Eventually 20 divers were brought in from five dive companies and three provinces...Most divers had never dived in a fish pen and required training before doing a dive ... There were also some issues with communication between the divers, pump operators and the deck. Some divers had very good communication gear, while others had limited to no communication gear." (Fisheries and Marine Institute 2020, p. 24)



Diving and MME mort removal NL

• "On some sites, nets were weighed down by dead fish to depths well below 15 m that would require decompression dives to clean up. A component of the diver safety SOP that was implemented *ad hoc* during the clean-up included an assessment of each net pen to determine if the diver could do the dive safely based on the depth of the dead fish mass...Each diver averaged about 6 hours per day in the water...There is no question that this is an arduous dive schedule day in and day out." (Fisheries and Marine Institute 2020, p. 24)

Also: No requirement in place for companies to contact NL OHS Branch in response to the event and prior to implementation of diving





10

Chilean salmon aquaculture with cumulative MME mortalities by region, November 2016 to June 2022 in tons.

Source: Cavalli et al. 2023



Chile reported MME mortalities 2016-2022

- -

30-





Chile and MMEs (Cavalli et al. 2023)

Chile MME case study highlights risks related to transport of dead fish for disposal

- 1. High reliance on fishing and other vessels for transporting MME morts
- 2. Vessel crews with limited training/knowledge OHS hazards- risk of injuries, falls overboard, capsizing, potential exposures to deadly H2S gas and potentially to antimicrobials, AMR bacteria, etc.
- 3. Potential exposures to algae via harmful algae blooms may pose OHS risk (discussed in Neis et al. 2023)
- 4. Based on exposure to H2S in 2016, Chile implemented guidelines for safe removal waste from MMEs.





AMR and MMEs: Literature map of peer-reviewed studies containing empirical evidence of antibiotics, their metabolites, and AMR genetic determinants within open systems salmon aquaculture environments* (Cavalli et al. 2022)



*An absence of cross-sectional studies hinders risk analyses to evaluate human health risks directly associated with AMR genetic determinants in aquaculture environments, represented by large external arrows, particularly during intensive and high-contact operations required during MMEs

Sources:

³(Tomova et al. 2015); ^{4, 7, 11}(Higuera-Llantén et al. 2018; Chiesa et al. 2019; Salgado-Caxito et al. 2022); ^{1,2,5,6,9}(Buschmann et al. 2012; Aedo et al. 2014; Tomova et al. 2018; Domínguez et al. 2019; Ramírez et al. 2022); ⁸(Thomassen et al. 2022); ¹⁰(Muziasari et al. 2016; WHO 2022).

MMEs and distance to hospitals and hyperbaric chambers in Aysen, Chile

30-





Bow-tie AOHS Risk Assessment for MMEs

in-





FRONTIER INSTITU

MME Hazard and Risk Assessment Results & Conclusion



Findings indicate variability in MME definitions, requirements for event reporting and MME-related contingency planning encompassing AOHS across countries.



A preliminary bow-tie risk analysis highlights key hazards and potential pathways between MME-prevention planning, monitoring and response and AOHS risks.



AOHS concerns need to be fully and effectively integrated into broader risk assessments on ways to reduce MMEs and their consequences in marine finfish aquaculture.

Photo credits: John Inge Johansen, NRK Norway, Edgar McGuinness, B. Neis



More generally...

AOSH marginalised and often forgotten in existing aquaculture research/policy

Results:

- Huge global gap in knowledge, resources and systematic monitoring
- Significant opportunities for multistakeholder and inter-agency collaboration – producers, workers, government, NGOs, researchers
- Start now by drawing on examples of good practice





UN commitment to the issue of decent work and aquaculture OSH is ongoing ...

The aquaculture workforce is exposed to multiple OSH hazards with short- and long-term consequences. The hazards may vary significantly depending on the type and scale of operation. Underdeveloped OSH management systems and weaker regulatory frameworks and enforcement systems, particularly in informal and rural economies, exacerbate the challenge. In recent years, constituents in several leading aquaculture producing countries have taken important steps in establishing a

stronger preventive culture and adequate legal frameworks on OSH. Further efforts are needed to ensure occupational safety and health for the aquaculture workforce.

(Conclusions of the ILO Technical meeting on the future of work in aquaculture in the context of the rural economy, 2021a)



Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations



Globally commitment to AOSH should be prioritized at the same level as product quality, biosecurity, food safety and environmental sustainability in the sector.

- develop integrated AOSH actions appropriate for diverse settings, especially in low and middleincome countries
- ensure "greater uptake of international codes, better risk assessment and OSH management, adoption of technological innovations, and effective OSH regulation and enforcement, adequate resources, training and information" (Cavalli et al. 2019).
- For rural areas and vulnerable populations (precariously employed) combine employment standards and OHS inspection capacity



Thank you

Questions and Comments





Research funding was provided by the Ocean Frontier Institute, through an award from the Canada First Research Excellence Fund and from the Department of Industry, Energy and Technology (IET), Government of Newfoundland and Labrador.





Sources

Aedo S, Ivanova L, Tomova A, Cabello FC. 2014. Plasmid-Related Quinolone Resistance Determinants in Epidemic Vibrio parahaemolyticus, Uropathogenic Escherichia coli, and Marine Bacteria from an Aquaculture Area in Chile. Microb Ecol. 68(2):324–328. <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/s00248-014-0409-2</u>

125

Buschmann AH, Tomova A, López A, Maldonado MA, Henríquez LA, Ivanova L, Moy F, Godfrey HP, Cabello FC. 2012. Salmon Aquaculture and Antimicrobial Resistance in the Marine Environment. PLOS ONE. 7(8):e42724. <u>https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0042724</u>

Cavalli, L., Jeebhay, M. F., Marques, F., Mitchell, R., Neis, B., Ngajilo, D., & Watterson, A. (2019). Scoping Global Aquaculture Occupational Safety and Health. *Journal of Agromedicine*, 24(4), 391–404. https://doi.org/10.1080/1059924X.2019.1655203

Cavalli, L., F. Blanco Marques, A. Watterson, (2019). A critical overview of work-related injury and illness in aquaculture workers from Brazil. Reviews in Aquaculture 12(2).

Cavalli, L., Tapia-Jopia, C., Ochs, C.L., Lopez-Gomez, M.A., Neis, B. 2023. Salmon mass mortality events and occupational health and safety in Chilean aquaculture, All Life, 16:1, 2207772, https://doi.org.10.1080/26895293.2023.2207772

Chiesa LM, Nobile M, Ceriani F, Malandra R, Arioli F, Panseri S. 2019. Risk characterisation from the presence of environmental contaminants and antibiotic residues in wild and farmed salmon from different FAO zones. Food Additives & Contaminants: Part A. 36(1):152–162. <u>https://doi.org/10.1080/19440049.2018.1563723</u>

Domínguez M, Miranda CD, Fuentes O, de la Fuente M, Godoy FA, Bello-Toledo H, González-Rocha G. 2019. Occurrence of Transferable Integrons and sul and dfr Genes Among Sulfonamide-and/or Trimethoprim-Resistant Bacteria Isolated From Chilean Salmonid Farms. Front Microbiol. 10:748. <u>https://doi.org/10.3389/fmicb.2019.00748</u>

Fry, J. P., Ceryes, C. A., Voorhees, J. M., Barnes, N. A., Love, D. C., & Barnes, M. E., (2019). Occupational Safety and Health in U.S. Aquaculture: A Review. *Journal of Agromedicine*, 24(4), 405–423. https://doi.org/10.1080/1059924X.2019.1639574

Fisheries and Marine Institute of Memorial University of Newfoundland. 2020. A review of the 2019 Newfoundland and Labrador South Coast Cultured Atlantic Salmon Mortality Event. Report submitted to the Department of Fisheries and Land Resources, Government of Newfoundland and Labrador, March 16, 2020. <u>publications-pdf-2019-salmon-review-final-report.pdf (gov.nl.ca)</u>

Higuera-Llantén S, Vásquez-Ponce F, Barrientos-Espinoza B, Mardones FO, Marshall SH, Olivares-Pacheco J. 2018. Extended antibiotic treatment in salmon farms select multiresistant gut bacteria with a high prevalence of antibiotic resistance genes. Luo Y, editor. PLoS ONE. 13(9):e0203641. <u>https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0203641</u>

Holmen, I. M., & Thorvaldsen, T. (2018). Occupational health and safety in Norwegian aquaculture - National profile for an

FAO report on global aquaculture OHS. In SINTEF Ocean reports. SINTEF Ocean.

ILO, (2021a). Technical meeting on the future of work in aquaculture in the rural economy, Geneva. *wcms 832490.pdf (ilo.org)



ILO, (2021b). The future of work in aquaculture in the context of the rural economy, Background document for discussion at the technical meeting on the future of work in aquaculture in the context of the rural economy, International Labour Office, Sectoral Policies Department, Geneva. Mitchell, R. J., & Lystad, R. P. (2019). Occupational injury and disease in the Australian aquaculture industry. *Marine Policy*, 99, 216–222. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.marpol.2018.10.044

Muziasari WI, Pärnänen K, Johnson TA, Lyra C, Karkman A, Stedtfeld RD, Tamminen M, Tiedje JM, Virta M. 2016. Aquaculture changes the profile of antibiotic resistance and mobile genetic element associated genes in Baltic Sea sediments. Smalla K, editor. FEMS Microbiology Ecology. 92(4):fiw052. <u>https://doi.org/10.1093/femsec/fiw052</u>

Neis, B., and C. Knott (2020). Canada Country Profile of Aquaculture Occupational Safety and Health. Social Licence & Aquaculture Atlantic Canada. <u>https://coastalfutures.ca/wp-content/uploads/2018/11/AOHS-Report-on-Canada-Final-2020.pdf</u>

120-

Neis, B., Gao, W., Cavalli, L., Thorvaldsen, T., Holmen, I. M., Jeebhay, M.F., Lopez Gomez, M. A., Ochs, C. L., Watterson, A. Beck, M., Tapia-Jopia, C. 2023. Mass mortality events in marine salmon aquaculture and their influence on occupational health and safety hazards and risk of injury. Aquaculture 566 739225 <u>https://doi.org/10.1016.j.aquaculture.2022.739225</u>

Ngajilo, D., & Jeebhay, M. F. (2019). Occupational injuries and diseases in aquaculture – A review of literature. Aquaculture, 507, 40–55. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aquaculture.2019.03.053</u>

Ochs, C., Neis, B., Cullen, K., & McGuinness, E. J. (2021). Occupational safety and health in marine aquaculture in Atlantic Canada: What can be learned from an analysis of provincial occupational injury compensation claims data? *Aquaculture*, *540*, 736680-. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aquaculture.2021.736680</u>

Ramírez C, Gutiérrez MS, Venegas L, Sapag C, Araya C, Caruffo M, López P, Reyes-Jara A, Toro M, González-Rocha G, et al. 2022. Microbiota composition and susceptibility to florfenicol

and oxytetracycline of bacterial isolates from mussels (Mytilus spp.) reared on different years and distance from salmon farms. Environmental Research.

204:112068. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envres.2021.112068

Salgado-Caxito M, Zimin-Veselkoff N, Adell AD, Olivares-Pacheco J, Mardones FO. 2022. Qualitative Risk Assessment for Antimicrobial Resistance among Humans from Salmon Fillet Consumption Due to the High Use of Antibiotics against Bacterial Infections in Farmed Salmon. Antibiotics. 11(5):662. <u>https://doi.org/10.3390/antibiotics11050662</u>



Sajid, Z., Gamperl, A. K., Parrish, C.C. et al. 2024. An aquaculture risk model to understand the causes and consequences of Atlantic salmon mass mortality events: a review. Reviews in

30-

Aquaculture. https://doi-org.qe2a-proxy.mun.ca/10.1111/raq.12917

Singh, G. G., Sajid, Z., & Mather, C. (2024). Quantitative analysis of mass mortality events in salmon aquaculture shows increasing scale of fish loss events around the world. Scientific

Reports, 14(1), 3763-3763. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-024-54033-9

Størkersen, K., Thorvaldsen, T., Kongsvik, T., & Dekker, S. (2020). How deregulation can become overregulation: An empirical study into the growth of internal bureaucracy when

governments take a step back. Safety Science, 128, 104772-. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ssci.2020.104772

Thomassen GMB, Reiche T, Tennfjord CE, Mehli L. 2022. Antibiotic Resistance Properties among Pseudomonas spp. Associated with Salmon Processing Environments. Microorganisms.

10(7):1420. https://doi.org/10.3390/microorganisms10071420

Tomova A, Ivanova L, Buschmann AH, Rioseco ML, Kalsi RK, Godfrey HP, Cabello FC. 2015. Antimicrobial resistance genes in marine bacteria and human uropathogenic *E scherichia*

coli from a region of intensive aquaculture: Acquired resistance in marine and clinical isolates. Environmental Microbiology Reports. 7(5):803-809. https://doi.org/10.1111/1758-2229.12327

Tomova A, Ivanova L, Buschmann AH, Godfrey HP, Cabello FC. 2018. Plasmid-Mediated Quinolone Resistance (PMQR) Genes and Class 1 Integrons in Quinolone-Resistant Marine Bacteria and Clinical Isolates of Escherichia coli from an Aquacultural Area. Microb Ecol. 75(1):104–112. <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/s00248-017-1016-9</u>

Watterson, A., Jeebhay, M. F., Neis, B., Mitchell, R., & Cavalli, L. (2020). The neglected millions: the global state of aquaculture workers' occupational safety, health and well-being.

Occupational and Environmental Medicine (London, England), 77(1), 15–18. <u>https://doi.org/10.1136/oemed-2019-105753</u>

